

2013 Annual Awards Entry Form (Complete one for each entry.)

Entry Name	Making Performance Reviews Meaningful – Enriching Development Through Dialogue	
	Fill out the entry name <i>exac</i>	<i>tly</i> as you want it listed in the awards program.
HFA	North Carolina Housing Finance Ag	gency
Submission Contact	Margaret Matrone	
Phone	919-877-5606 Em	ail <u>mamatrone@nchfa.com</u>
Program Contact	Molly Rodgers	
Phone	919-850-2860 Em	ail <u>mlrodgers@nchfa.com</u>

Entry form with description, check(s), and visual aids (optional) must be received by NCSHA by **Monday**, July 1, 2013.

Use this header on the upper right corner of each page.

\_\_\_\_\_

HFA \_\_\_\_\_

Entry Name

Communications	Homeownership	Legislative Advocacy	Management Innovation
□Annual Report □Promotional Materials and Newsletters □Creative Media	<ul> <li>Empowering New Buyers</li> <li>Home Improvement and Rehabilitation</li> <li>Encouraging New Production</li> </ul>	☐ Federal Advocacy ☐ State Advocacy	□Financial ⊠Human Resources □Operations □Technology
Rental Housing	Special Needs Housing	Special Achievement	Are you providing visual aids?
☐Multifamily Management □Preservation and Rehabilitation □Encouraging New Production	□Combating Homelessness □Housing for Persons with Special Needs	□Special Achievement	⊠YES □NO

### North Carolina Housing Finance Agency Making Performance Reviews Meaningful – Enriching Development through Dialogue Category: Management Innovation - Human Resources

We all have suffered through the painful process of performance reviews - that dreaded exercise that seems to hold little value for the employee or the organization. The supervisor struggles to find the right words to say the same thing year after year. The employee wants feedback, yet there is little or no dialogue. Ratings are inconsistent and full of rater errors, biases and even inaccuracies that undermine confidence in the process. Everyone works hard, yet no one is satisfied. We try new forms and provide more training, yet the process still doesn't work. Supervisors labor over the reviews or simply put off the arduous task, and employees remain dissatisfied.

According to Psychology Today, managers rate performance reviews as the task they dislike the most, second only to firing someone. A Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM) study found that 90% of performance appraisals are painful and don't work. Even pop culture icons like Dilbert and The Office skewer the typical performance review process.



### The Challenge

A World at Work study found that over two-thirds of employees say that they have too little interaction with their boss. "Managers are neglecting one of the most fundamental aspects of their job: providing feedback. Especially in these stressful times, employees are desperate for feedback and interaction with their boss. And when they don't get it, their job performance suffers," said Mark Murphy, chairman of Leadership IQ.

Like at most organizations, the annual performance review process at North Carolina Housing Finance Agency was labor-intensive. A typical review was at least 12 pages long with some over 20 pages. The questions required extensive narrative responses from both the employee and the supervisor and the responses were often repetitive. The questions tried to hit the important notes: Employee Development, Training Needs, Job knowledge and Skills, Quality of Work, Working Relationships, Initiative, and Outstanding Accomplishments. Yet the written review, if it was done at all, ultimately only skimmed the surface because it was too often handed to the employee with little or no discussion. Without contextual discussion, employees often misinterpreted and reacted strongly to a word or phrase, complaining frequently to HR. The end result? Hours of work brought very little value to the employee or the Agency.

It was time to listen. During several focus groups, supervisors and employees shared their frustration and disdain for the entire process. Employees felt that the current system did not encourage discussion

### North Carolina Housing Finance Agency Making Performance Reviews Meaningful – Enriching Development through Dialogue Category: Management Innovation - Human Resources

and that they wanted communication, honesty and fairness. Supervisors also wanted feedback and communication from employees. Everyone agreed there was way too much writing and not enough talking.

So our performance reviews weren't working, yet employees and supervisors were craving interaction and communication from each other. How could we cross this divide?

### **The Solution**

Our research told us that a rating scale was a huge distraction and inconsistently applied across the Agency. And while the most important part of the performance review process is the discussion, this crucial dialogue between the supervisor and the employee was often missed. It seemed that the ratings and written comments got in the way of meaningful conversations and helping people grow. How could we get supervisors and their employees talking?

Features of a new process were studied. The arbitrary rating scale would have to go. These ratings brought no value and often got in the way of meaningful conversation. A mechanism to promote discussion, to engage, to review and to plan would be required.

It wouldn't be enough to just tell supervisors to have a conversation with the employee. The conversation would need to be guided to include several key discussion areas to provide structure and ensure consistency across the Agency. The discussion items would need to be important to the employee, the supervisor and the Agency to spark meaningful dialogue and actively engage the employee.

To help facilitate and guide this conversation more than just a new form was needed. Based on our analysis, we determined that several essential discussion areas were needed. Possible questions for each discussion area were researched and included so the supervisor could concentrate on listening instead of having to think of the next question.

Many of the discussion items and suggested questions support the critical elements of employee engagement drawn from the Gallup's 12 Elements of Great Managing, which was based on 30 years of research and study of more than 17 million employees. These discussion areas and a few of the suggested questions to ask the employee are:

- Discuss employee's performance of primary responsibilities/priorities/goals Do you know what's expected to successfully do your job? What is your greatest accomplishment this year?
- Discuss employee's strengths and areas for additional focus related to Agency Success Attributes *We Care. We Act. We Lead.*
- Discuss any barriers to work performance and job satisfaction What is your greatest strength that is not being used at the Agency? Why do you stay at the Agency?
- Discuss ideas for improving work processes What's the most frustrating work process and how can we make it better?

### North Carolina Housing Finance Agency Making Performance Reviews Meaningful – Enriching Development through Dialogue Category: Management Innovation - Human Resources

- Discuss employee's development (past year and plans for future growth) What's your future dream role? What new skills would you like to learn?
- Discuss employee's suggestions for supervisor Do you get enough feedback from me? How do you like to be rewarded and recognized for a job well done?
- Discuss employee's suggestions for the Agency What materials/equipment do you need in order to do your job well? What would make the Agency an even better place to work?

This redesigned performance process will also allow for the supervisor and the employee to develop the goals for the coming year. Each of the goals should be tied to one of the seven primary Agency strategies allowing the employee to see the connection between their work and the Agency mission and success. Understanding how their work is critical to the Agency enables employees to become more fully engaged.

Finally, after the discussion, comes some writing. The written comments summarize the discussion and highlight important discussion items, both exceptional performance or items that need attention or improvement. The employee may also add any comments. Since the written comments follow and summarize the discussion there should be no surprises or misunderstandings for the employee or the supervisor.

Training is a key component to this process. Supervisors are encouraged to listen more than talk to ensure the conversation is a dialogue, not a monologue. Supervisors are also encouraged to ask questions rather than just provide the solutions. The right question at the right time can help deepen the relationship and understanding between the employee and the supervisor and help both to reflect on their own performance and generate longer term employee growth.

### Summary

Feedback has been extremely positive: Employees and supervisors alike have welcomed the change. Conversations are happening. The short performance review meetings now often last 90 minutes or more with supervisors learning more about their employees and employees becoming more engaged. Several position adjustments and redeployments of staff have resulted from supervisors having this opportunity to learn more about the strengths and interests of employees, better matching their work to those strengths and interests. One sure way to tell that it's working – there have been no more employee complaints to HR about the content of the performance review.

Based on solid research and modeled on the successful experiences and processes of many organizations, the new performance review system has become an important vehicle to drive meaningful conversation and deliver better performance, production, and work satisfaction from employees and supervisors for the Agency. Because it can be easily modified, other organizations can replicate it and customize it to meet their own unique needs.

Feedback and Development		
Annual Discussion Report and Goal Plan		
Employee Name Position		
Discussion Period Supervisor Name		
Date of Discussion		
This form is to annually document that the following topics have been discussed by the supervisor and employee. The Anr Plan should be developed and submitted to HR with this completed form.	iual Goal	
Discussion Agenda	Check when completed	
<ol> <li>Discuss employee's performance of primary responsibilities/priorities/goals since the last discussion.         <ul> <li>Are there significant changes? Revise written job description if needed (Copy to HR and employee)</li> <li>Discuss how the employee's work relates to the business unit objectives and to the Agency Goals</li> </ul> </li> <li>Questions to ask the employee:</li> </ol>		
Do you know what is expected to successfully do their job?		
<ul> <li>What is your greatest accomplishment of the past year?</li> <li>What are the most and least satisfying aspects of your job?</li> </ul>		
Discussion comments:		
<ul> <li>2. Discuss employee's strengths and areas for additional focus related to Agency Success Attributes:</li> <li>We Care</li> <li>We Act</li> <li>We Lead</li> <li>Customer Focus</li> <li>Honesty and Integrity</li> <li>Job Knowledge</li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>Communication</li> <li>Positive Attitude</li> <li>Quality of Work</li> <li>Discussion Comments:</li> <li>Judgment/Decision Making</li> <li>Judgment/Decision Making</li> <li>Teamwork / Team Orientation</li> <li>Teamwork / Team Orientation</li> <li>Teamwork / Team Orientation</li> <li>Teamwork / Team Orientation</li> <li>Flexibility</li> <li>Sense of Urgency</li> <li>Initiative and Innovation</li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>3. Discuss any barriers to work performance and job satisfaction.</li> <li>Questions to ask the employee: <ul> <li>Why do you stay with the Agency?</li> <li>What strengths and talents do you possess that are not being used?</li> <li>What would make your work more meaningful and challenging?</li> <li>What is your greatest roadblock or challenge?</li> </ul> </li> <li>Discussion Comments:</li> </ul>		
4. Discuss ideas for improving work processes		
4. Discuss ideas for improving work processes Questions to ask the employee:		
<ul> <li>How can we improve a process in our business group?</li> <li>What is the most frustrating work process and how can we make it better?</li> <li>Discussion Comments:</li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>5. Discuss employee's development (past year and plans for future growth)</li> <li>Questions to ask the employee: <ul> <li>What is your future dream role?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>What new skills and training have you learned this past year and what would you like to learn in the coming year?</li> </ul>		
Discussion Comments:		
<ul> <li>6. Discuss employee's suggestions for supervisor</li> <li>Questions to ask the employee:</li> <li>Do you get enough feedback from me about work?</li> </ul>		
What can I do to help you succeed?		
How do you like to be recognized or rewarded for a job well done? Discussion Comments:		

		1 1
7. Discuss employee's suggestions for the Agency		
Questions to ask the employee:		
• What materials/equipment do you need in order to do your	ob well?	
• If you could change one thing about the Agency, what would	it be?	
<ul> <li>What would make the Agency an even better place to work?</li> </ul>		
Discussion Comments:		
8. Discuss anything else the employee or supervisor would like to add	ress	
Discussion Comments:		
9. Develop goals and priorities for the year ahead. (Complete Annual (	Coal and Professional Development Plan	
3. Develop goals and phonties for the year arread. (Complete Arridan		
Supervisor Summary Comments: (Additional pages may be attached in	f needed)	
Employee Comments: (Additional pages may be attached if needed)		
Employee comments. (Additional pages may be attached in needed)		
Employee meets or exceeds job expectations		Yes
(if no, a Performance Improvement Plan must be developed and imple	mented and submitted to HR.)	No
These topics have been discussed by:		
Employee Signature	Date	
Supervisor Signature	Date	

# ANNUAL GOAL AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

### Employee

Year

Working with the employee, the supervisor will identify a minimum of 3 to 5 specific goals for the upcoming performance year. These items may be related to new responsibilities/projects and/or improvement and development of current job responsibilities and support an Agency Strategy or Objective. The Supervisor and the Employee should review together at least every six months.

Employee Goal	Agency Strategy/Objective Supported By Employee Goal	Supervisor Comments/Suggestions (optional)

### **Training and Growth Plan**

Professional development is an important element of our work. Supervisor and employee should outline a plan for continued growth and development, which should focus on the following three areas:

Enhancement of knowledge, skills, and abilities in areas related to current responsibilities

Training and development for future opportunities

Professional development

Training Opportunities	Timeline

Employee Signature	Date
Supervisor Signature	Date

# Feedback and Development - Discussion Report and Goal Plan Instructions for the Supervisor

# 1. FAD Discussion Process and Timeline

Feedback and Development - Annual Discussion Report and Goal Plan

To be completed annually usually in January – February. (Please see HR if another time frame is needed.) Please follow these steps:

- Supervisor reflects on the performance of the employee and makes notes of items to be discussed with the employee.
- Supervisor schedules an appointment for the meeting with the employee. The meeting may be a lunch meeting, if budgeted.
- Supervisor and Employee meet for discussion per FAD format discussion items. Supervisor may use the **Annual Fad Form Discussion Version** form to take notes during the discussion. (This version has extra space for written note-taking.)
- Discussion should be thorough and not rushed.
- Supervisor should ask open-ended questions, not yes or no questions. Follow the format and suggested questions on the form and in this document. This is the time for the employee to talk more than the supervisor. Review suggested questions to develop your discussion agenda before the meeting. Feel free to ask additional or follow-up questions.
- Discussion should include review of employee's performance and goal progress over the past year. Supervisor should give constructive feedback to the employee about their performance over the past year.
- Discussion should include development of goals and training needs for the upcoming year. A follow-up goals planning discussion may be needed.
- Annual Goal and Professional Development Plan should be completed by Supervisor and Employee during the discussion or during a follow-up discussion.
- <u>Supervisor will complete the "Annual FAD Form Final" AFTER the discussion meeting.</u> Supervisor should memorialize the discussion with the written comments. There are now text boxes for comments in each discussion area. Comments may be made in each discussion area in addition to summary comments.
- Employee may add comments on the form or add additional pages of comments.
- Both pages are to be signed and dated. Copies may be made for supervisor and employee (or an electronic copy saved to save trees) and original submitted to HR. Signed Annual FAD and Goal Plan should be submitted to HR by Feb 28<sup>th</sup>.

# Feedback and Development -Interim Discussion Report

Interim performance discussions are to be held at least once during the year, about six months after the annual discussion. More frequent discussions, perhaps quarterly meetings, are encouraged.

- Supervisor and Employee meet for discussion as above. Discussion should be thorough and not rushed.
- Supervisor should ask open-ended questions, not yes or no questions. This is the time for the employee to talk more than the supervisor. Review suggested questions to develop your discussion agenda before the meeting. Give employee a "heads-up" on the questions that will discussed.
- Discussion should include review of job performance and goals. Annual goal plan should be reviewed and revised if necessary.
- <u>Supervisor will add comments to memorialize important discussion items exceptional performance or areas that need attention after the discussion meeting.</u> Employee may add comments on the form or add additional pages of comments. Discussion report form is signed and dated. Copies are made for supervisor and employee and original signed form is submitted to HR.

# 2. The Discussion

During an employee appraisal, a supervisor needs to listen more than they talk. Most supervisors leap straight into giving their opinion of an employee's performance and then giving the employee solutions on what they should do to fix it.

A good supervisor takes a page out of a coach's book and asks questions rather than provide solutions. They know that great questions can help a person stop and reflect rather than just leap into action. Reflection is the greatest source of learning. A powerful question at the right moment, which triggers thought and reflection and then action, will help a person learn more than if you just do it yourself.

Ideally a performance discussion should be at least 50% the employee assessing and not more than 50% of you asking questions and adding in your comments and suggestions, as well as your perceptions. This should be a dialogue, not a monologue. If you ask the right questions – you will build a stronger relationship with your employee and create more productive outcomes

With employee performance reviews, the right question at the right time will help you deepen your relationship and understanding of the employee, as well as help them reflect on their own performance. You will generate more powerful and effective answers and longer term employee growth through asking strong, reflective questions.

### A few tips:

**Don't ask questions when you're not prepared to hear the answers:** Sometimes people ask questions but are willing to accept only a specific answer. For example, if you really have no interest in hearing that you're a poor manager, don't ask, "Do you think I'm a good or poor manager?" When you ask a question, you have to be willing to consider whatever responses you get, and not overreact.

**Questions that start with "Why" tend to make people feel defensive:** It's just a quirk of our language. You can replace "why" questions with phrasing that tends not to cause that reaction. For example, rather than asking "Why are you late so often?", try "Are there any particular things that are getting in the way of arriving at work on time?" Notice the difference in feel?

**Don't use questions to say things indirectly**: This is a technique commonly used by parents on children, so it's interpreted as manipulative and patronizing. For example, "Don't you think you should be more diligent in completing your work?" isn't really a legitimate question. It's a rhetorical question -- a statement dressed up as a question. It will be heard as "I want you to be more diligent in completing your work." Questions used to mask statements or requests create **mistrust**.

**Avoid compound questions:** A compound question consists of several parts: it's actually several questions in one. Compound questions are confusing and tend to result in low-quality responses. Here's an example: "Is there some reason why you have been late on many Fridays and why you tend to leave early on Wednesdays?" That's two questions and you're not likely to get good answers to both. Separate the issues and make your questions simpler and more specific.

# 3. Suggested Questions

If you talk without listening, then you are not helping your employee to learn and improve their performance. So what do you ask? Here are a few possible questions for each section of the FAD discussion format.

# Discuss employee's performance of primary responsibilities/priorities since the last discussion.

- What was your favorite task/role/project in the past 12 months and why? What made it so special? What made it successful? What did you do to make it work so well? These are great questions as it helps you to find patterns of success. You get to learn what motivates your team member.
- What have you done to deliver more value to the Agency than you did 3-6 months ago? With this question you are getting the employee to consider how they value add, rather than remain at the same level.
- What makes you feel like a valuable contributor?
- What is most satisfying about your job?
- What is least satisfying about your job?

# Discuss employee's strengths and areas for additional focus related to Agency Success Attributes:

(see the Agency Values and Success Attributes (attached))

- Why do you stay with the Agency?- Employee retention is a critical part of building a productive workforce. Find out what makes your employees stay and you will be half of the way towards retaining your best employees.
- What strengths or talents do you possess that aren't being used?
- What makes for a great workday?
- What was the best day at work you've had in the last three months? What were you doing? Why did you enjoy it so much?
- What was the best praise and recognition you've ever received? What made it so good?

# Discuss any barriers to work performance and job satisfaction

- Over the past year, what is one thing you would do differently and what did you learn from it? Often this
  will help identify areas you need to keep an eye on in the future. For example, was there a particular
  personality they couldn't work with, were they having problems with time management or trouble with
  balancing work and life? By having them reflect and learn from their mistakes you help teach that
  mistakes happen in life it is what you do with them that are important.
- What would make your life easier at work? Often little things cause people to leave jobs like simple problems with communication and poor work layout and design. Many times employees won't tell you these problems unless you specifically ask them. Make sure you always ask.
- What would make your work more meaningful and satisfying?
- What is your greatest challenge or roadblock?
- If you could go back to any previous position and stay for an extended period of time, which one would it be and why?
- What was the worst day at work you've had in the last three months? What were you doing? Why did it grate on you so much?
- What was the best praise and recognition you've ever received? What made it so good?

## Discuss ideas for improving work processes.

- How do you think we can improve the (\_\_\_\_) process? (define a certain work processes)
- Do you see any bottlenecks in any of our work processes? If yes.. How might we simplify the process?
- What is your most frustrating work process? What would make it better?

## Discuss employee's development (past year and plans for future growth)

- What is your future dream role? How can we put elements of this into your role? How can I help move you towards it? For this, don't be limited by the current job or role. Think across business groups.
- What new skills and experiences have you acquired in the past 12 months?
- What motivates you?
- What de-motivates you?
- Do you receive enough training to do your job effectively?
- How can the Agency and I help you reach your career goals?
- When in your career do you think you were learning the most? Why did you learn so much? What is the best way for you to learn?

## Discuss employee's suggestions for supervisor

- How do you like to be recognized/rewarded for a great job? Don't just talk the first answer with this. Dig a bit deeper and don't stay with "money" as the answer. Some people like to be praised in front of others for other people public praise is a punishment and they would prefer to sink into the floor. How does this person like to hear/know they have done a great job?
- How do you like to be managed? Am I watching too closely or not enough? Would you like more/less contact?- This is often a hard question to ask and to hear the answer to. If you have built your relationship effectively, you may hear some problems with your management style. This is the time to listen and see if you can come up with a workable solution for both of you.
- How do you feel I am doing as your supporting leader?
- Do you receive sufficient feedback about your performance?
- What was the best relationship with a manager you've ever had? What made it work so well?

## Discuss employee's suggestions for the Agency

- If you could change one thing about the Agency, what would it be?
- How do you feel the Agency and our team are doing?
- What would make the Agency an even better place to work?

## Discuss anything else the employee or supervisor would like to address

Of course you need to include questions relating to projects, goals and objectives, but by starting the discussion with deeper and more reflective questions you will be forming a great platform upon which to tackle those questions

# 4. Agency Values and Success Attributes

To be used in the discussion of employee's strengths and areas for additional focus.

### We Care

#### We respect all people. We listen to understand. We support our employees. We have a passion for our work

<u>Customer Focus (External and Internal)</u> - Is attentive to customer requests, taking the initiative to help solve problems in a costeffective manner with courtesy. Asks appropriate questions to understand and satisfy needs. Deals with customers fairly, honestly, and truthfully. Is creative when resolving customer problems and concerns.

<u>Communications</u> - Communicates ideas, thoughts and suggestions in a concise yet thorough, well organized, accurate and articulate manner when either speaking or writing. Uses the most appropriate and effective manner to communicate so messages can be easily understood.

<u>Positive Attitude</u> - Demonstrates a positive and professional attitude toward work, customers and colleagues; Projects a positive outlook; Is pleasant to work with; Achieves a positive relation with and is helpful to coworkers, supervisor and customers; Contributes to a favorable public image of NCHFA; Has merited the trust and respect of others within and outside the department

<u>Quality of Work</u> – Produces work that is complete, accurate and error-free; checks accuracy of own work; recognizes and corrects errors; requires little or no supervisory review

#### We Act

We work with integrity and professionalism. We manage resources wisely. We do what we say we will do. We promote cooperation and teamwork. We forge strong partnerships.

<u>Honesty and Integrity</u> - Respects our Core Values: Ensures that all laws and regulations are followed and upheld; Manages time wisely, demonstrating the ability to effectively carry out responsibilities and meeting job expectations. Shows respect for NCHFA property, practicing appropriate use of equipment and supplies.

<u>Judgment/Decision Making</u> - develops alternative courses of action and makes decisions based on logical assumptions, which reflect factual information; takes responsibility for those decisions

<u>Teamwork / Team Orientation</u> - Responds promptly and with respect to the needs of co-workers, demonstrates creativity and flexibility while helping resolve their problems and concerns. Actively participates in team meetings and other activities, motivating others and demonstrating a positive influence.

<u>Productivity</u> – consistently completes work assignments, facilitates workflow and reports progress to supervisor as needed, learns and uses technology and equipment to improve productivity

<u>Dependability</u> – Conscientious, responsible and reliable with respect to work completion, deadlines and attendance and punctuality; uses resources, including time, effectively and efficiently.

<u>Accountability</u> – delivers the value and performance, goals expected with no surprises; responsible for own actions <u>Accepts feedback</u> - Accepts feedback in a professional and open manner

### We Lead

We invest to improve lives and communities. We seek long term solutions. We pursue new capital to solve housing problems. We innovate to respond to needs. We strive for excellence.

<u>Job Knowledge</u> - Is technically competent and well versed in his/her field of expertise; keeps knowledge and skills current <u>Problem solving</u> – Recognizes and provides fair and prompt resolutions to work related problems

<u>Flexibility</u> – Adjusts appropriately and with ease to unexpected situations and changes.

<u>Sense of Urgency</u> - Demonstrates a bias for action; Focuses on speed without sacrificing quality; Sets priorities and seizes opportunities; Has high energy and excitement around projects and assignments.

<u>Initiative and Innovation</u> - Takes reasonable risks and uses job knowledge to improve NCHFA processes, products, services and programs, improve efficiency and reduce costs. Shows a willingness to adapt to change. Anticipates customer and NCHFA's future needs, identifies potential products and services to meet those needs.